



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

## Edinburgh Research Explorer

### From du Cerceau to du Cerceau

**Citation for published version:**

Campbell, I 2015, 'From du Cerceau to du Cerceau: Scottish aristocratic architectural taste, c. 1570 to c. 1750', *Architectural Heritage*, vol. 26, no. 1, pp. 55-71. <https://doi.org/10.3366/arch.2015.0067>

**Digital Object Identifier (DOI):**

[10.3366/arch.2015.0067](https://doi.org/10.3366/arch.2015.0067)

**Link:**

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

**Document Version:**

Peer reviewed version

**Published In:**

Architectural Heritage

**Publisher Rights Statement:**

This article has been accepted for publication by Edinburgh University Press in Architectural Heritage.

**General rights**

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

**Take down policy**

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact [openaccess@ed.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@ed.ac.uk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



Ian Campbell: From Du Cerceau to Du Cerceau: Scottish aristocratic architectural taste c. 1570- c. 1750

The 1990 exhibition on the Scottish Renaissance, curated by Charles McKean and Deborah Howard, was the final victory in a war waged over more than a century between those who argued that French influence was pervasive in the élite architecture of sixteenth- and seventeenth centuries in Scotland and those who argued it was overwhelmingly a home-grown phenomenon.<sup>1</sup> The exhibition and Charles's subsequent publications, most notably, *The Scottish Chateau*, demonstrated beyond reasonable doubt that there was extensive French influence.<sup>2</sup> This paper extends this debate by focusing on the influence of the printed pattern books of Jacques Androuet du Cerceau (fl. c. 1545- c. 1585) on one particular house, Careston Castle, five miles west of Brechin in north Angus, and goes on to suggest that their influence pervaded Scottish architecture much more widely than has been realised, only fading after the final defeat of the Stuarts in 1745.<sup>3</sup>

MacGibbon and Ross, writing c. 1890, dismissed comprehensively the notion of French influence asserting that:

The only exceptions are Stirling and Falkland, where we believe French workmen were employed. These two buildings however stand alone, both in point of time and design, and are the exceptions which prove the rule.<sup>4</sup>

This remained the orthodoxy for the next century, despite two publications by W. Douglas Simpson, which cast doubt on it. One, in 1942, on Glenbuchat Castle in Aberdeenshire, argued persuasively that its builders around 1590 had knowledge of Philibert de l'Orme's *Premier livre d'Architecture* published in 1567.<sup>5</sup> The other, published a decade later, demonstrated beyond doubt that Drochil Castle built for the Regent Morton in Peeblesshire around 1580, was inspired by the plans of Du Cerceau, although 'Design C' in the latter's first architectural pattern book, known as either the *Petites Habitations* or *Logis domestiques* (1547-50) is a closer source than the plan of Chenonceau in *Les Plus Excellents Bastiments* (1576-9) suggested by Simpson.<sup>6</sup> Instead of investigating further, Stewart Cruden, the government's Principal Inspector of Ancient Monuments from 1946 until 1984, who was

<sup>1</sup> D. Howard et al., *The Architecture of the Scottish Renaissance*, Edinburgh, 1990.

<sup>2</sup> C. McKean, *The Scottish Chateau: the country house of Renaissance Scotland*, Stroud, 2001.

<sup>3</sup> J. Guillaume, with P. Fuhring (eds), *Jacques Androuet du Cerceau 'un des plus grands architectes qui se soient jamais trouvés en France'*, Paris, 2010.

<sup>4</sup> D. MacGibbon and T. Ross, *The Castellated and domestic architecture of Scotland from the twelfth to the eighteenth century*, 5 vols, Edinburgh, 1887-92, 2, p.14. They instead suggest that links with the Low Countries and Germany should be more explored (Vol. 2, p.13), which demonstrates that they were not 'Little Scotlanders'.

<sup>5</sup> W. Douglas Simpson, 'Glenbuchat and its castle', in idem (ed.), *The Book of Glenbuchat*, Aberdeen, 1942, pp.1-38 at pp.35-7.

<sup>6</sup> W. Douglas Simpson, 'Drochil Castle and the plan "tout une masse"', *PSAS*, 86, 1951-2, pp.70-78; Jacques Androuet Du Cerceau, *Les plus excellents bastiments de France*, ed. D. Thomson, 2 vols, Paris, 1988, p.237. For 'Model C' in *Petites habitations*, see D. Thomson, 'France's Earliest Illustrated Printed Architectural Pattern Book: Designs for living "à la française" of the 1540s', in *Architecture et vie sociale* (ed. Jean Guillaume), Paris, 1994, pp.221-34, at ??, figs 5 and 6??

responsible for writing the official guidebooks to many of the principal ancient monuments in state care, merely retreated a little from the extreme position of MacGibbon and Ross. In *The Scottish Castle* (1960) he wrote that:

These instances of enlightened patronage introducing foreign notions [Drochil, Fyvie, Huntly, Edzell, Crichton] are exceptional and save for those works and those of the Court School in the first half of the sixteenth century, there are no castles which prompt a search for foreign explanations. The gentry, however widely travelled, were evidently well satisfied with the customary style, the result of the slow and unconscious moulding of architectural form from generation to generation. For the innumerable tower houses there is no hint of French mason or French influence, except in the alleged affinity of the architecture itself. This would be sufficient if true, but upon analysis, it will be seen that the resemblances are not convincing.<sup>7</sup>

Given such an apparently authoritative judgment by a figure of Cruden's stature, it is perhaps not surprising that most subsequent scholarship toed the party line until the 1990s.

Thus, MacGibbon and Ross's damning verdict on Careston Castle, to which we now turn – that it 'is said to be of considerable age, but has no pretension to architectural effect' – held sway until 1993 when David Walker recognised it as 'one of the greatest houses of the Scottish Renaissance'.<sup>8</sup> This was despite the fact that a well-illustrated article in *Country Life* in 1913 revealed the quality of the house to anyone who cared to look.<sup>9</sup>

Careston<sup>10</sup>

A late seventeenth-century source, John Ochterlony, describes Careston Castle or House, as 'a great and most delicat house, well built, brave lights and of a most excellent contrivance, without debate the best gentleman's house in the shyre', and states that it was built by 'Sir Harry Lindsay of Kinfaines after[wards] Earl of Crawford'.<sup>11</sup> Henry Lindsay was the second son of David, tenth earl of Crawford, and was born before 1564.<sup>12</sup> He appears to have been adopted in his youth by John Charteris of Kinfauns in Perthshire, whose surname he took for a while, and whose

<sup>7</sup> S. Cruden, *The Scottish Castle* [PLACE AND DATE?], p. 194.

<sup>8</sup> MacGibbon and Ross, *Castellated and Domestic Architecture*, *op. cit.*, 4, p.80 (from the accompanying rudimentary and inaccurate plan it is clear that they had no first-hand knowledge of the house): D. Walker (unpublished), 'Notes compiled for a visit by the 1993 Scottish Civic Trust Conference to Careston Castle, 3 April 1993', p.1 (copy lodged in the library of RCAHMS, Edinburgh).

<sup>9</sup> [L. Weaver], 'Careston Castle, Forfarshire, the seat of Mr. W. Shaw Adamson', *Country Life*, 33, 1913, pp.310-14.

<sup>10</sup> The fullest and most recent account is in J. Gifford, *Dundee and Angus*, New Haven and London, 2012, pp.408-14, written without first-hand knowledge of the interior and largely relies on Weaver, 'Careston Castle', Walker, 'Notes', and photographs supplied by myself.

<sup>11</sup> J. Ochterlony, *Account of the Shire of Forfar circa 1682*, Forfar, 1969, pp.24-5.

<sup>12</sup> J. Lindsay, Earl of Crawford and Balcarres, *Case of James Earl of Balcarres, &c., claiming the titles, honours and dignities of the Earldom of Crawford, and older Barony of Lindsay*, s.l., 1845, p.76.

estate and house he appears to have inherited, hence the territorial designation given him by Ochterlony.<sup>13</sup> In or shortly before 1586 he took as his first wife Helen Chisholm of Kinfauns and it has been considered likely that Careston Castle was begun in connection with the marriage.<sup>14</sup> The first mention of the 'new place of Carraldstoun' is in 1592.<sup>15</sup> In fact, it is only in 1600 that Henry Lindsay is first styled 'of Careston', suggesting that the new house had reached completion and become his principal seat.<sup>16</sup> It may be significant that the year before, he had married his second wife. She was Margaret Schaw of Sauchie, who is described as belonging to the court of James VI's consort, Anne of Denmark, of whose household Lindsay was master.<sup>17</sup> A nineteenth-century Lord Crawford described Henry as 'wild, prodigious and tyrannical' but provides no evidence to substantiate this damning assessment.<sup>18</sup> One suspects that he confused Henry with his elder brother, David, the eleventh earl (b. before 1564 - d. 1607), or with the latter's son, also David (bap. 1576- d. 1620), the twelfth earl.<sup>19</sup> The former was exiled for murdering Lord Glamis, the Chancellor in March 1578, and imprisoned in 1589 for his part in the abortive rising of the Catholic earls. The latter was known as 'the prodigal earl' and died a debtor in Edinburgh Castle.<sup>20</sup> On succeeding as thirteenth earl, Henry had to pay off his nephew's debts, having already begun to dispose of his estates as early as 1612 when Kinfauns was sold, and included Careston as security for a loan from William Forbes of Craigievar in 1619.<sup>21</sup> After Henry's death in 1623 his nephew, Alexander

<sup>13</sup> J. Balfour Paul (ed.), *The Scots Peerage*, 9 vols, Edinburgh, 1904-14, 3, p.32.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid.*, and Walker, 'Notes', p.1.

<sup>15</sup> *Registrum Magni Sigilli Regum Scotorum*, 11 vols, Edinburgh, 1910-14, 5, p.696, no. 2052.

<sup>16</sup> Lindsay, *Crawford Case*, p. 82; A. Jervise, *The History and Traditions of the Land of the Lindsays in Angus and Mearns with notices of Alyth and Meigle*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. rev. by James Gammack, Edinburgh, 1882, p. 282. There is a false report in the *New Statistical Account*, 15 vols, Edinburgh and London, 1845, 11, p.529 that by 1595 Careston had already passed into the hands of Sir Alexander Carnegie of Balnamoon. This is repeated by Jervise in *Land of the Lindsays*, p. 283, but he signals his scepticism by prefacing the statement with 'said' in italics. Weaver, however ('Careston Castle', p. 310) accepts the claim without question.

<sup>17</sup> Balfour Paul, *Scots Peerage*, 3, pp.32-3; J. Melville, *The memoirs of Sir James Melville of Halhill : containing an impartial account of the most remarkable affairs of state during the sixteenth century not mentioned by other historians, more particularly relating to the Kingdoms of England and Scotland under the reigns of Queen Elizabeth, Mary, Queen of Scots & King James, in most of which transactions the author was personally and publicly concerned*, ed. with an introduction by Gordon Donaldson, London, 1969, p.157. She was a cousin of William Schaw, Master of Works.

<sup>18</sup> A.W. Crawford Lindsay, *Lives of the Lindsays; or A Memoir of the Houses of Crawford and Balcarres*, 3 vols, London, 1849, 1, p.297.

<sup>19</sup> Lindsay, *Crawford Case*, p. 80; Allan White, 'Lindsay, David, eleventh earl of Crawford (d. 1607)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, Oxford University Press, 2004 [<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/16693>, accessed 30 June 2014]

<sup>20</sup> Lindsay, *Crawford Case*, p. 80; A. White, 'Lindsay, David, eleventh earl of Crawford (d. 1607)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, Oxford University Press, 2004 [<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/16693>, accessed 30 June 2014]; Lindsay, *Lives of the Lindsays*, 1, pp.387-8.; Balfour Paul, *Scots Peerage*, 3, pp.31-2.

<sup>21</sup> *RMS*, 7, p.296, no. 792 (Edinburgh, 31 December, 1612); Lindsay, *Crawford Case*, pp.80 and 84; Jervise, *Land of the Lindsays*, p.282; A.J. Warden, *Angus or Forfarshire, The Land and People, descriptive and historical*, 5 vols, Dundee, 1880-85, 3, p. 74.

Lindsay, second Lord Spynie, paid off the loan to Forbes and acquired Careston.<sup>22</sup> However, by 1633, Sir Alexander Carnegie of Balnamoon is recorded in possession and by 1639 he had obtained permission to create a new parish of Careston and built a new church to serve it.<sup>23</sup> The Carnegies sold Careston in 1707 to John Stewart of Grandtully and Murthly, whose arms and the date 1714 are placed over the present front door of the castle.<sup>24</sup> In 1721, the estate was bought by Major George Skene and passed down to his descendants until it was sold to John Adamson in 1873, in whose family it remains.<sup>25</sup>

### Description and Analysis

The principal, façade, to the south, consists of a central block, three and a half storeys high by five windows wide, except for the central door on the ground floor (fig. 1). This central block is flanked by two four-storey jambs or wings, stepped forward and outward from the main block. The jambs are gabled with plain skews and chimney stacks and have two windows to each storey to the front, while their inner sides each have a door at ground level and a window above, some of which are blocked. The whole is built of rubble with plain ashlar dressings to doors and windows, from local red sandstone, apart from the rusticated pink granite voussoirs of the first and second floor windows of the central block, and a yellow sandstone panel in the middle of the main block bearing the arms of Sir John Stewart from 1714.<sup>26</sup> The timber arcade with elliptical arches stretching between the wings at ground floor level is clearly a late nineteenth-century addition but may replace an original one in stone, just as the timber upper portions of the five dormers are evidently replacements of similar date of earlier stone dormers.<sup>27</sup> Otherwise the general impression is of a fairly unified late seventeenth- or early eighteenth-century house, but a glance at the plan by David Walker reveals that the main block and west jamb date from the late sixteenth century, and that the south façade is the result of a remodelling when the east wing jamb was added, which is consistent in style with some interior doors bearing the date 1702 (fig. 2).

The earlier date of the west jamb and the central block is evident when they are seen from the west: the second floor windows (that of the jamb blocked) have rusticated voussoirs like those on the front, but those on the third floor of the main block are framed by pilasters and pediments (fig. 3). The corresponding blocked one on the jamb retains the pilasters but its pediment has been sacrificed to the plain c.1700 wall head, which rests on what must be an original sixteenth-century cable

<sup>22</sup> *RMS*, 8, p.152, no. 437 (Edinburgh, 19 March, 1623); Warden, *Angus*, 3, p.74. On Spynie, see Balfour Paul, *Scots Peerage*, 8, pp.102-4; and E.M. Furgol, 'Lindsay, Alexander, second Lord Spynie (c.1597–1646)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, Oxford University Press, 2004; online edn, Oct 2006 [<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/16681>, accessed 3 July 2014]

<sup>23</sup> Warden, *Angus*, 3, pp.66 and 75. The belief that Carnegie had acquired Careston by 1631 (Paul, *Scots Peerage*, 8, p.61) is based on the grant of the teinds to the new parish by Charles I, which is misdated 1631 instead of 1641; see *Registrum Episcopatus Brechinensis*, 2 vols, Edinburgh 1856, 2, pp. 311-12.

<sup>24</sup> Jervise, *Land of the Lindsays*, p.283; Warden, *Angus*, 3, p.75.

<sup>25</sup> Jervise, *Land of the Lindsays*, pp.284-7

<sup>26</sup> Gifford, *Dundee and Angus*, p.410.

<sup>27</sup> *Ibid.* p. 410; McKean, *Scottish Chateau*, pp.208-9.

moulding, which extends across a circular stair turret projecting from the re-entrant corner between the jamb and the central block and wraps round the turret's upper window. The turret was no doubt originally crowned with a conical roof, as shown in Charles McKean's reconstruction sketch (fig. 4). The present capping of battlements is part of a Gothick remodelling c.1790.<sup>28</sup> The crowstepping of the gable of the central block is consistent with the sixteenth-century date, in contrast with the east elevation, where the gable has plain skews. Similarly its windows seem to have been given c. 1700 mouldings at the time the east jamb was added.

The lower two floors of the rear (north) elevation are obscured by nineteenth-century additions but it is clear that it was virtually blind, with an off-centre stair turret projecting from the wall surface, again crowned with battlements, and corner turrets to the north-east and north-west, all adorned with a ring of Gothick quatrefoils below the battlements.

Inside, the ground floor of the central block consists of two smaller vaulted chambers to the west of a passage on the central axis, with a large vaulted kitchen to the east, all opening on to a corridor to the south. The original principal stair giving access to the first floor is a handsome scale and platt, in the west jamb, with finely moulded risers, the newel decorated with a cable moulding, and a pendant at the centre of the groin vault at the top.

At first-floor level, the hall (now the drawing room) originally occupied the western two thirds of the main block lit by three windows to the south, very like the still extant arrangement at Castle Menzies, at Weem in Perthshire of similar date.<sup>29</sup> But whereas at the latter, a simple partition wall separates the hall from the private chamber to the east, at Careston, the wall between is thick enough to accommodate two fireplaces back to back. The two carved chimneypieces are of the highest quality and, in 1999, Howard Colvin recognized that they closely resemble designs by Jacques Androuet du Cerceau, *Second Livre* (1561) (figs. 5 and 6).<sup>30</sup> To the north of the fireplaces, a passage links the drawing room to the east chamber (now the dining room) and also opens on to the rear turnpike stair, the only stair which originally ran the whole height of the house. To the south of the fireplaces is a small rib-vaulted alcove off the dining room. A door linking it to the hall is an insertion c. 1700, while the high-relief pediment over it on the alcove side is clearly one of the original external dormer heads. An aumbry in the alcove dated 1623 led Walker and Gifford to argue that the alcove, wall and fireplaces all date from a remodelling during Alexander, Lord Spynie's brief tenure. Walker suggests that the original hall fireplace stood on the north wall opposite the surviving buffet inserted in the south wall, an

<sup>28</sup> Gifford, *Dundee and Angus*, p.410

<sup>29</sup> J. Gifford, *Perth and Kinross*, New Haven and London, 2010, pp.262-7; McKean, *Scottish Chateau*, pp.131-3.

<sup>30</sup> H. Colvin, *Essays in English Architectural History*, New Haven and London, 1999, p.116, figs 92-3. The plates in the *Second Livre* were published without numbers. Here the numbering refers to those on the version available at *Architectura: architecture, textes et images XVI et XVII siècles* (<http://architectura.cesr.univ-tours.fr/traite/Images/LES1598Index.asp>) the ordering of which differs considerably from that in the facsimile edition published as Jacques Androuet du Cerceau, *Les trois livres d'architecture* : Paris, 1559, 1561, 1582, Ridgewood NJ, 1965. The drawing room fireplace is largely based on *Second livre*, pl. 9 but borrows elements, notably the caryatids, from pl. 20 (Colvin only refers to this second plate). The dining room fireplace closely resembles *Second livre*, pl. 1

arrangement again analogous with Castle Menzies.<sup>31</sup> He also surmises that the subdivision of the hall's western bay into two smaller rooms dates from this time, while Gifford prefers that it happened around 1700.<sup>32</sup>

On the second floor, the original room arrangement probably repeated that of the first floor with the large room above the hall acting as a gallery.<sup>33</sup> It had two fireplaces set into the north wall, along with one in the north wall of the east chamber (fig. 7). Although their carving is cruder than those on the first floor the overmantels all owe their form to Du Cerceau's designs, while the lower parts are unrelated, consisting of columns with splayed bases, the capitals of which are either of stylised foliage (east and west rooms) or fleurs de lis (central corridor).<sup>34</sup> Walker dates them to the 1620s, contemporary with those on the first floor, while Gifford puts them c.1640, probably relying on the armorial evidence of the coat of arms on the overmantel of the west room fireplace.<sup>35</sup> All the fireplace openings were contracted as part of the considerable works on the floor around 1700, about which more could be written but they are not relevant to the present argument about the dating and the extent of the Du Cerceau influence.<sup>36</sup>

One can understand why Walker and Gifford might date the Du Cerceau fireplaces to the early-mid seventeenth century: not only is there the 1623 date on the alcove aumbry, but there is more evidence that pattern books were circulating by then. There are comparable fireplaces copied from Serlio from around this time, one in the Library ('King Charles's Room') at Winton in East Lothian (1620-7) and the other recorded by MacGibbon and Ross in a house in South Queensferry, dated 1636.<sup>37</sup> However, a Serlio design had already been copied for the fireplaces at Newark Castle, Port Glasgow and at Spedlins in Dumfriesshire, the former dated around 1597 and the latter 1605, both during the time of Henry Lindsay's ownership of Careston.<sup>38</sup> There are other compelling reasons for thinking the Careston fireplaces were part of the original building.

For a start it is questionable that the wall between the first floor hall and east chamber has been thickened. It is difficult to think of comparable examples to the rib vaulting in the alcove in the 1620s or later but it is very similar to that found in several Aberdeenshire castles built in the late sixteenth century for families which

---

<sup>31</sup> Walker, 'Notes', p.2

<sup>32</sup> Ibid., p.2; Gifford, *Dundee and Angus*, p.411.

<sup>33</sup> Walker, 'Notes', p.2; Gifford, *Dundee and Angus*, p.413.

<sup>34</sup> That in the north-west room is based on *Second livre*, pl. 18; that in the corridor on *Second livre* pl. 13; and that in the east room on *Second livre*, pl. 5.

<sup>35</sup> Walker, 'Notes', p.1; Gifford, *Dundee and Angus*, p.413.

<sup>36</sup> Gifford, *Dundee and Angus*, p.413.

<sup>37</sup> On the Winton fireplace, see C. McWilliam, *Lothian except Edinburgh*, Harmondsworth, 1978, p.473. It is based on a design from Sebastiano Serlio's first pattern book to be printed, the *Regole generali di architettura*, Venice, 1537, fo.47r, which became the fourth book of *Tutte le opere di architettura et prospettiva*, Venice, 1584, where it is found on fol. 168v. On the South Queensferry fireplace, see MacGibbon and Ross, *Castellated and Domestic Architecture*, 5, p.50, fig. 1159. It is after Serlio, *Regole generali*, fol. LXVr/ *Tutte le opere*, fol. 186v.

<sup>38</sup> On the fireplace in Newark Castle, see MacGibbon and Ross, *Castellated and Domestic Architecture*, 4, pp.425-31, at p.40, fig. 869; on the Spedlins' fireplace, see Gifford, *Dumfries and Galloway*, London, 1996, pp.522-3; MacGibbon and Ross, *Castellated and Domestic Architecture*, 4, p.45, fig. 515. Both are based on Serlio, *Regole generali*, fo.36r/ *Tutte le opere*, fol. 157r.

remained Catholic.<sup>39</sup> Henry Lindsay's elder brother, David, eleventh early of Crawford, was a prominent member of the Catholic nobility, and it seems reasonable to assume Henry was too, especially as a master of the Catholic convert Anne of Denmark's household. Therefore the alcove could have served as an oratory for the house where the building of a chapel might have been seen as too ostentatious. Neither, Alexander, Lord Spynie, nor the Carnegies were Catholic.

Secondly the plan of Careston can be interpreted as incorporating at least two of Du Cerceau's house designs. In his first *Livre d'Architecture* (1559), 'Design 9' shows an H-plan house with a main block five windows wide at the front, with a basement, two main floors and an attic storey with dormers above (fig. 8). The two front projecting wings each have doors on their inner faces and contain scale and platt stairs. On the rear elevation, the windows have surrounds with prominently rusticated voussoirs. The other design, the fourth in the *Troisième Livre* (1582), is a variant on an H- or I-plan house (fig. 9). The main block has a ground floor with vaulted chambers like Careston, with towers at the corners, again with doors on their inner faces and scale and platt stairs, here linked by an arcade supporting a first-floor terrace. Meanwhile the two rear wings step out beyond the main block as at Careston.

The several points of similarity with Careston are obvious but it can easily be objected that the plan as it is now only dates from c.1700 and we have no firm evidence that a U-plan was originally intended. Given that the very comparable Castle Menzies and the slightly smaller Hatton (in Angus) and Glenbuchat Castles, are all Z-plans, is it not more likely that this was intended at Careston?<sup>40</sup> The analogy would be with Balloch, now Taymouth, Castle, which, in the late sixteenth century, comprised a main block and a stepped west jamb, as can be seen on Timothy Pont's map, dating from the 1590s.<sup>41</sup> Only from 1737-42 did William Adam make it U-plan with an east jamb to match the west.<sup>42</sup> U-

centuries, but there are early seventeenth-century villas or country houses, suggesting it is not inconceivable that Careston was always intended to be a strict U-plan. Among these are Baberton, now in the western suburbs of Edinburgh, built from 1612-22 by Sir James Murray of Kilbaberton for himself; Pitreavie, near Dunfermline, built around 1614 for the Wardlaw family, for both of which Charles Wemyss has suggested a Du Cerceau inspiration.<sup>43</sup> There is also the southern wing of Drum in Aberdeenshire, built 1615-21, where the two corner towers project beyond the length of the central block; and Ballencrief in East Lothian, remodelled as a U-plan villa in 1625, by Sir Patrick Murray, which, however, Walker uses plausibly to argue for the remodelling of Careston, in the 1620s.<sup>44</sup> Hence we are not able to

Commented [I1]: SOMETHING MISSING HERE?

<sup>39</sup> I.D.B. Bryce and A. Roberts, 'Post-Reformation Catholic houses in north-east Scotland', *PSAS*, 123, 1993, pp.363-72, at pp.366-7.

<sup>40</sup> On Hatton, see W. Kelly, 'The Castle' in *The Book of Glenbuchat*, ed. Simpson, pp.49-56, at pp.53-4, figs 42-4 and Gifford, *Dundee and Angus*, pp.519-21.

<sup>41</sup> McKean, *Scottish Chateau*, p.28, fig. 2.4 and pp.105-6.

<sup>42</sup> W. Adam, *Vitruvius Scoticus*, ed. J. Simpson, Edinburgh, 1980, pls 50-51.

<sup>43</sup> Charles Wemyss, 'A study of aspiration and ambition : the Scottish Treasury Commission and its impact upon the development of Scottish country house architecture 1667-1682', unpub. Ph.D. thesis, 2 vols, University of Dundee, 2008, 1, pp.132-3. On Baberton and Pitreavie, see McKean, *Scottish Chateau*, pp.193-4 and 205-6.

<sup>44</sup> On Drum see McKean, *Scottish Chateau*, pp.207-8. On Ballencrief, see Walker, 'Notes', p.1.



prove our case by comparable examples alone, and so we must ask if there any more clues in the fabric of Careston itself.

There are the three features which strengthen the argument that Henry Lindsay was inspired by Du Cerceau. Firstly, the cable moulding on the newel post of the scale and platt stair is reminiscent of the cabling on the columns of another of Du Cerceau's fireplace designs.<sup>45</sup> However, it has to be admitted this is still a weak argument since the cabling could have been added at the same time as the first floor fireplaces if they were added in the 1620s or 30s. The second is an engaged column on the rear stair at the entrance to the first floor (fig. 10), which is very like those of the Du Cerceau-inspired fireplaces in the east bedroom on the second floor (fig. 7). No one has suggested that the rear stair is anything other than part of the original house and therefore that would make the fireplace columns contemporary with it. Certainly, stylistically, they look more sixteenth-century than seventeenth, being not dissimilar from the columns on the fireplaces in the James V palace block at Stirling Castle. However, it could be argued that the Du Cerceau overmantels were only added in the seventeenth century.<sup>46</sup> Stronger is the presence of the granite rustication to the window surrounds on the first and second floors, which we have already compared to the design in the first *Livre d'Architecture* (fig. 8). It seems inconceivable that anyone later would go to the trouble and considerable expense of altering so many window surrounds nor is it easy to point to comparable examples from the 1620s/30s nor from around 1700. While none of these alone might clinch the argument, cumulatively they do suggest that it is more likely than not that the influence of Du Cerceau was present from the start, which raises the question of the presence of his books in Scotland in the late sixteenth and seventeenth centuries.

The evidence of Drochil proves that at least one of Du Cerceau's works was available around 1580, and although it may be impossible to prove that Henry Lindsay had access to them, there is no inherent reason why he should not. The library of the earls of Crawford contained Du Cerceau's *Plus excellents Bastiments* in the nineteenth century but we do not know when it entered the collection.<sup>47</sup> An obvious possibility is that it was bought by David, eleventh earl, Henry's brother, who travelled in France and Italy from 1579-1581.<sup>48</sup> Nor would it have been a problem to have books sent from France within weeks of their publication. Although a little late for our purposes, among the Crawford Papers in the National Library of Scotland is an inventory of some of the books Alexander Seton, earl of Dunfermline, had at Pinkie, dated 1625, three years after his death. Besides a copy of *Plus excellents Bastiments*, Seton owned Du Cerceau's *Leçons de perspective positive* (1576) as well the architectural treatises of Palladio and Serlio, and that on military

---

<sup>45</sup> *Second livre*, pl. 4

<sup>46</sup> Walker, 'Notes', p.3, believes that the circular panel in the overmantel of the fireplace in the second floor west room, which bears the arms of the wife of Alexander Carnegie, is original with the rest of the carving, whereas other armorial panels such as those of the dining room fireplace and that of the second floor east room, are later insertions.

<sup>47</sup> J.L. Lindsay, earl of Crawford and Balcarres, 8 vols, *Bibliotheca Lindesiana*, Aberdeen, 1910-13, 1, p.234. A letter from the present Lord Crawford, dated 2002, confirms that the book is no longer in the library at Balcarres.

<sup>48</sup> White, 'Lindsay, David, eleventh earl of Crawford (d. 1607)'.

architecture by Francesco de'Marchi.<sup>49</sup> Again we have no way of proving when they were acquired but we know he was educated and travelled in Italy and France and therefore there seems no reason to believe they cannot be in Scotland before 1600 and that other aristocrats did not share his tastes.<sup>50</sup>

One house that suggests even earlier knowledge of Du Cerceau is Cowdenknowes in Berwickshire where a three-storey U-plan house was erected from 1574 by Sir James Home, Warden of the East Marches.<sup>51</sup> With its principal door and stair in the south-west projecting wing, and the three-window-wide main block the inspiration again seems to be the first *Livre*, Model 9. With its fine Renaissance detailing including pilasters framing the first floor windows, it is a house deserving more attention than it can be given here.

For the Scottish country house after 1600, our understanding has suffered until recently from its being seen through the lens of English architectural history, which has traditionally concentrated on finding Italian sources of inspiration, most blatantly exemplified in John Summerson's *Architecture in Britain 1530 to 1830*, where in its 611 pages, pre-1707 Scottish architecture is relegated to an appendix of fourteen pages.<sup>52</sup> Charles Wemyss has argued cogently that given the francophilia of the Scots, the French dimension in Scottish architecture has to be given much more consideration throughout the seventeenth century.<sup>53</sup> We have already referred to his suggestion that both Baberton and Pitreavie are inspired by Du Cerceau, and in the second half of the century he has demonstrated that Methven owes its plan to Du Cerceau.<sup>54</sup> His suggestion, however, that the perron stair on to the terrace at Drumlanrig comes directly from Du Cerceau's view of Fontainebleau in *Plus excellents Bastiments* is less convincing than James Macaulay's linking it to the illustration by Pierre Le Muet of the château of Pontz, though Macaulay does point to Du Cerceau's illustration of Charleval as the source of Drumlanrig's giant order, semi-circular pediment, and perhaps the plan.<sup>55</sup>

Others can be added to this group although we cannot investigate them fully here. Hatton House, built from 1665, for Charles Maitland, later third earl of Lauderdale, with its square plan and four circular corner pavilions, is a grander version of Methven and surely inspired by a combination of Designs C and E in *Petites Habitations*, and/or Design 12 in the 1559 *Livre d'architecture* with their

---

<sup>49</sup> NLS, Crawford Personal Papers, Acc. 14/2/2, fol. 1r (I am very grateful to Lord Crawford for granting me access).

<sup>50</sup> M. Lee jun., 'Seton, Alexander, first earl of Dunfermline (1556–1622)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, Oxford University Press, 2004; online edn, May 2006 [<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/25113>, accessed 4 July 2014]

<sup>51</sup> K. Cruft, J. Dunbar and R. Fawcett, *Borders*, New Haven and London, 2006, pp.194–7.

<sup>52</sup> J. Summerson, *Architecture in Britain 1530–1830*, first paperback edition, Harmondsworth, 1969.

<sup>53</sup> Wemyss, 'A study of aspiration and ambition', 1, p.14 and C. Wemyss, 'Pavilion or pediment? The development of the Scottish country-houses in the post-Restoration period' in *"The Mirror of Great Britain": National identity in seventeenth-century British architecture*, ed. O. Horsfall Turner, Reading, 2012, pp.187–207 at p. 203.

<sup>54</sup> On Baberton and Pitreavie, see Wemyss, 'A study of aspiration and ambition', 1, pp.132–3; on Methven, see C. Wemyss, 'Paternal Seat or Classical Villa? Patrick Smyth, James Smith and the Building of Methven 1678 to 1682', in *Architectural History*, 46, 2003, pp.109–26.

<sup>55</sup> J. Macaulay, *The Classical country house in Scotland 1660–1800*, London, 1987, p.28; Pierre Le Muet, *Manière de bien bastir pour toutes sortes de personnes*, Paris, 1681, pl. 62; Du Cerceau, *Plus excellents bastiments*, pp.207–17.

circular corner pavilions. Raised central blocks are found in Du Cerceau designs such as no. 27 in the *Troisième livre* (1582), but in the case of Hatton, its presence was dictated by the incorporation of a pre-existing tower house.<sup>56</sup> Also popular was the central block and pavilions type of house into which category Careston itself falls. Later examples include Castle Stuart, near Inverness, built or remodelled for the earl of Moray from 1619 to 1625 as a U-plan house with stepped jambs, a slightly smaller version of Careston, which may give us the best impression of the appearance of Careston before it was domesticated around 1700.<sup>57</sup> An even closer reliance on the first *Livre* Model 9, is demonstrated by Gallery House (1677-80) north of Brechin, which like the original is double pile with wings which are not stepped outward.<sup>58</sup> The west (entrance) front of Brechin Castle itself, as remodelled by Alexander Edward from 1696-1708 as a three storey main block with central pediment and circular corner towers, bears a strong resemblance to the château at Ollainville built for Henri III in the northern Île de France, to the designs of Baptiste Androuet Du Cerceau's (1579-85).<sup>59</sup> Although too late to be illustrated by Jacques Androuet in *Plus excellents Bastiments*, it could have been seen by Edward on his tour of the London, Paris and the Low Countries undertaken in 1701-2.<sup>60</sup>

Even after the Union with England Du Cerceau's influence is still discernible. William Adam's already-mentioned scheme for Balloch/Taymouth to make it a U-Plan with a terrace between the pavilions appears to have been inspired by *Troisième Livre*, Design 4, while his Hamilton Parish Church, circular with four projecting arms, surely owes its form to the extraordinary house of similar plan in the 1559 *Livre d'architecture*, Design 16.<sup>61</sup> We end with Inveraray Castle, begun in 1745, to the designs of the English architect, Roger Morris for the third duke of Argyll. Ian Lindsay and Mary Cosh interpreted it as both importing the latest English Gothick style, and echoing Tudor houses such as Lulworth and Michelgrove.<sup>62</sup> The plan, however, with the twin stairs flanking the central hall can equally be seen as inspired by Du Cerceau's Design 12 in the 1559 *Livre d'architecture*, while the surrounding quatrefoil moat is like that surrounding Chambord in *Plus excellents Bastiments*.<sup>63</sup>

Thus even at the very moment that the Stuart cause was finally defeated, and with it the last ember of hope for Scottish political independence, the most powerful and loyal Hanoverian Scottish aristocrat was building a house reflecting Scotland's enduring cultural divergence from English taste, which has led to the undervaluing of its architectural heritage until the last two decades. It is hoped that the present

Commented [I2]: Something missing here before the date?

<sup>56</sup> On Hatton, see Wemyss, 'Pavilion or pediment?', pp.191-5. On the variety of invention with the basic building blocks by Du Cerceau, see M. Chatenet, 'The Paper Houses of Jacques Androuet du Cerceau', in *Architectural Heritage*, 18, 2007, pp.87-98.

<sup>57</sup> MacGibbon and Ross, *Castellated and domestic architecture*, 2, pp.479-83; J. Gifford, *Highlands and Islands*, London, 1992, pp.156-7.

<sup>58</sup> Wemyss, 'Paternal seat', pp.118-9

<sup>59</sup> On Edward's works at Brechin, see Gifford, *Dundee and Angus*, pp.379-80; on Ollainville, see J-P. Babelon, 'Henri III et l'architecture: les projets, les homes', in I. de Conihout, J-F. Maillard, G. Poirier (eds), *Henri III mécène: des arts, des sciences et des lettres*, Paris, 2006, pp.28-38 at p.30, fig.2.

<sup>60</sup> H. Colvin, *A Biographical dictionary of British architects 1600-1840*, 3<sup>rd</sup> edition, New Haven and London, 2005, pp.322-3.

<sup>61</sup> Adam, *Vitruvius Scoticus*, pls.12-13.

<sup>62</sup> I.G. Lindsay and M. Cosh, *Inveraray and the dukes of Argyll*, Edinburgh, 1973, pp.35-43, repeated by F.A. Walker, *Argyll and Bute*, London, 2000, p.313.

<sup>63</sup> Du Cerceau, *Plus excellents Bastiments*, pp.48-55.

article will contribute towards the much-deserved re-evaluation, and encourage others to discover more examples.

#### ILLUSTRATIONS

- Figure 1: West front of Careston, Angus
- Figure 2: Plans of Careston (David Walker)
- Figure 3: Careston from the west.
- Figure 4: Reconstruction of Careston west elevation (Charles McKean)
- Figure 5: Fireplace in Drawing Room, Careston
- Figure 6: Fireplace in Dining Room, Careston
- Figure 7: Fireplace in east room, second floor, Careston
- Figure 8: Du Cerceau, *Livre d'architecture*, Design 9
- Figure 9: Du Cerceau, *Troisième livre*, Design 4
- Figure 10: Engaged column at first floor level of rear stair, Careston